

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN MEDICAL SCHOOL DEPARTMENT OF LEARNING HEALTH SCIENCES

Ethics and Policy Issues for Learning Health Systems
LHS 671
Winter 2024

CREDIT HOURS: 3

PRE-REQUISITES None

FACULTY

Janice Firn, PhD

jfirn@umich.edu

517-290-8860

Office hours by appointment

COURSE DESCRIPTION

Bioethics is an enterprise in ascendance. In the early 1960s, there were individuals concerned with moral questions occasioned by medicine and medical research, but they were not known as bioethicists, nor did they have the institutional support of centers for bioethics, professional journals, government commissions, or graduate programs and professorships. Today bioethics is part of the landscape of the life sciences: “ethics committees” are now mandatory in American hospitals; all federally funded research that involves human beings or animals must be reviewed by a board constituted to protect the subjects of research; a plethora of seminars offer training in bioethics for those who need, or wish, to offer ethical advice; bioethics courses are now a regular part of the curriculum at universities, colleges and medical schools. Students in this course will learn about the social sources of morality; the organization of professions; the politics of science, medicine and biotechnology; the interface between law, policy, and ethics; the sociology of science; and the social uses of bioethics and policy in the complex context of learning health systems.

COURSE OBJECTIVES

By completion of the course students will be able to:

- Demonstrate a grounding in moral theory and in theoretical and empirical bioethics
- Assess the existing and emerging policies governing Learning Health Systems (LHS)
- Critically apply the insights from ethics and policy theories to the operation and governance of Health Systems including Learning Health Systems (LHS).

DROP/ADD DEADLINES

Monday, January 22 – full tuition refund

Monday, February 19 – half tuition refund

CONTENT TOPICS

- Meta Ethics
- Policy Fundamentals
- Bioethics
- Policy and The American Health Care System
- Ethics and Learning Health Systems
- Equity and Learning Health Systems

TEACHING METHODS

This is an online course, which will be delivered via Canvas. It is also your learning environment, where you will interact with a community of your classmates and the instructors. Within the course Canvas site, you will access the learning materials and syllabus, discuss issues, submit assignments, take exams, email other students and the instructors, participate in online activities including small groups, and display your projects.

This course will be taught using multiple methods, including, but not limited to: *readings, video, discussions, written assignments, and simulation exercises.*

The first half of the semester will be focused on frameworks for understanding ethics and policy. The 2nd half of the semester will be used to apply those frameworks to learning health systems design and implementation.

REQUIRED TEXTS AND OTHER MATERIALS

All resources are available through links provided in the course on Canvas; no resources will need to be purchased for this course.

Expectations

This is a small class; therefore, discussions will be the key to learning during the course. Assigned readings will prepare the student for discussions during class; outside research is encouraged, but not required (except as noted in certain assignments). Ethics and policy are dynamic and benefit from systematic thinking. We have tried to set up assignments and case studies that reflect real-world decision making. You should also draw on your own experiences and knowledge of the field of learning health systems to guide your thinking.

There is a lot of writing for this class; writing is a difficult skill to master and takes a lot of practice. In this field (policy and ethics), it is important to be able to write and communicate with multiple stakeholders. Being able to write with different audiences in mind is also challenging and rarely perfect. The weekly assignments and discussions are an opportunity to practice, to see what works and what does not within this arena.

Unless otherwise specified by the instructor(s) within the individual weekly assignment instructions, references should be properly and consistently cited using a recognized reference format of your choosing (i.e. APA, AMA, etc.).

COURSE POLICIES

Accessibility and Accommodations

Students should speak with their instructors before or during the first week of classes regarding any special needs. Students seeking academic accommodations should register with Services for Students with Disabilities (SSD). SSD arranges reasonable and appropriate academic accommodations for students with disabilities. Please visit <https://ssd.umich.edu> for more information.

GRADING AND EVALUATION

Grading will be based on five evaluation methods. They are detailed below:

1. **Fourteen class discussions** (15 points each)
2. **Eleven Assignments** (25 points each – the lowest grade will be dropped)
3. **One midterm paper**, worth 300 possible points
4. **One simulation over two weeks**, worth 300 possible points

GRADING POLICIES

No late assignments will be accepted without penalty unless an extension has been approved by the instructor(s). Requests for an extension must be made at least 24 hours before the assignment is due. Unless an agreement has been reached in advance with the instructor, the student will lose five points for every day that the assignment is late. For example, if the assignment is worth 25 points and is turned in one day late, the maximum number of points for that assignment will be 20/25. Two days late will result in the maximum number of points being 15/25, and so on. **Graded assignments and discussions will be returned through Canvas.**

The lowest weekly *assignment* grade will be dropped. If you have questions about a weekly assignment, please contact the instructor at least 24 hours before the assignment is due to discuss. If you would like the instructors to re-evaluate a weekly assignment grade, this is possible upon request, but they will reassess the entirety of the grade and it may or may not be higher than the grade you already have. Request for re-evaluation must be made no later than 72 hours after the grade has been posted. An extra credit assignment is available to anyone who falls below an expected grade of B- or below *for the course*.

Final grades will be accessible through Wolverine Access; grades for each assignment and discussion will be posted through the Canvas course site. Overall course grades are posted within 72 hours of when the final course assignment component (typically the final course project report) is due. The course grade will be a letter grade (A – D, F) following the weighting described below. Grades will be assigned using this conversion scale:

A+ 97-100	B+ 87-89	C+ 77-79	D+ 67-69	F <60
A 93-96	B 83-86	C 73-76	D 63-66	
A- 90-92	B- 80-82	C- 70-72	D- 60-62	

DLHS Grade Grievance Policy

Regular feedback on graded assignments and timely resolution of any grading concerns is helpful for student learning and contributes to an overall positive experience. Students are encouraged to discuss any assignment grade concerns with the instructor(s) within two weeks of the grades being posted on Canvas. Similarly, any concerns and grievances related to the overall course grades should be raised by contacting the faculty of record within two weeks of the course grades being posted on Wolverine Access.

For this course, the grade dispute arbitration will happen within the Department of Learning Health Sciences (DLHS). After initial discussion with the faculty of record for the course, there is an opportunity for a second look by another DLHS faculty member with appropriate expertise for resolving grade disputes. If the student and faculty are not able to come to an agreement about the grade dispute, the Associate Chair for Educational Programs or assigned designee will adjudicate the dispute. Per Rackham's Academic Dispute Resolution Process, if the concern is not resolved, the student may seek a formal resolution conference with the Medical School's Rackham Resolution Officer (see <http://www.rackham.umich.edu/policies/academic-dispute-resolution> for full policy and the contact information for the current resolution officer.

Student Academic Dispute Procedures

Rackham's Academic Dispute Resolution Policy and Procedures are available to Rackham students who have a dispute or disagreement with faculty or staff about the equity and fairness of decisions or procedures that affect their academic standing, the conduct of their research, and progress toward the degree. Such issues may arise regarding fair and equal treatment in the conduct of a class, in the pursuit of the student's research, and in the grading or evaluation of academic work and research. Other issues may concern the equity and fairness of program, department, or Rackham policies. <https://rackham.umich.edu/academic-policies/section9/>

WRITING ASSISTANCE

The UM Sweetland Center for Writing offers one-to-one, in-person and online writing assistance for U-M Ann Arbor graduate students in Writing Workshop. This service allows you to meet individually with an experienced faculty consultant at any stage of writing, from getting started to final revisions. You can get

help with understanding assignments, generating ideas, developing arguments, organizing, and structuring your project, using evidence and sources, and clarifying your expression. To learn more about their services visit <https://lsa.umich.edu/sweetland/graduates/writing-workshop.html>.

Purdue OWL, <https://owl.purdue.edu/>, is an online resource for reference writing and creating citations.

REMOTE LEARNING

While synchronous course instruction will be rare, there may be times when real-time discussion or small group meetings for assignments or group work may be needed. Instructors may also have office hours in real time as well.

The course will use Zoom for these synchronous (“real time”) meetings. Meeting dates and times will be scheduled through [Canvas](#) and should appear on your calendar within Canvas.

Please take the time to familiarize yourself with Zoom by visiting [U-M's Getting Started with Zoom](#) page. You may choose to use Zoom on your mobile device (phone or tablet).

This article describes how to update your name in Zoom:

<https://teamdynamix.umich.edu/TDCClient/30/Portal/KB/ArticleDet?ID=746>

Some students and faculty may also wish to add their personal pronouns beside their names.

Things to Know About Zoom:

- You must sign in to my Zoom session using your uniquename and password (for med.umich.edu users: enter your Level 1 credentials).
- The Zoom sessions are recorded.
- You can contact [Information and Technology Services](#) if you have any technical issues accessing Zoom. You can also contact [Health Information Technology & Services](#) for help.

Digital Etiquette

Let's give our name when beginning to speak; Let's use the chat and/or raise hand feature if we're waiting to speak; Let's use microphones and mute when not actively speaking to improve overall audio and caption quality.

INSTITUTIONAL POLICIES

Academic Integrity of Students

The academic community, like all communities, functions best when its members treat one another with honesty, fairness, respect, and trust. Your instructors expect students to work and study together to foster learning and understanding of the material. However, direct copying of homework, copying of homework from existing solutions, cheating on an exam, and other conduct that violates the academic integrity and ethical standards of the Rackham Graduate School community cannot be tolerated and will result in serious consequences and disciplinary action.

All written submissions must be your own, original work. We expect that your submitted work will represent your own thoughts, opinions, and knowledge. If you share it with anyone else prior to submission, you may contribute to a breach of academic integrity, and we encourage you not to share your written work with others until it has been assessed.

You may incorporate selected excerpts, statements, or phrases from publications by other authors, but they must be clearly marked as quotations and must be attributed. If you build on the ideas of prior authors, you must cite their work. You may obtain copy editing assistance, and you may discuss your ideas with others, but all substantive writing and ideas must be your own or be explicitly attributed to another.

A resource explaining academic integrity and plagiarism can be found here:
<https://guides.lib.umich.edu/c.php?g=1039501&p=7538393>

If we suspect you have cheated (including plagiarism), at the very least you will receive a zero on the assignment. Rackham policy dictates that we must report every instance of academic dishonesty, no matter how small. Suspected academic misconduct will be handled initially by your course instructor.
<https://rackham.umich.edu/academic-policies/section8/>

Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion

The Department of Learning Health Sciences (DLHS) is committed to developing the institutional mechanisms and norms necessary to promote the values of diversity, equity, and inclusion, both inside and outside our classrooms. To this end, DLHS upholds the expectations that all courses will: (1) be inclusive, (2) promote honest & respectful discussions, (3) follow multicultural ground rules and (4) abide by UM policies and procedures. Inclusive courses are those in which teachers and learners co-create and co-sustain environments that support and encourage all members to participate equitably.
<https://rackham.umich.edu/rackham-life/diversity-equity-and-inclusion/>

Student Mental Health and Well-Being

The University of Michigan is committed to advancing the mental health and wellbeing of its students. If you or someone you know is feeling overwhelmed, depressed, and/or in need of support, services are available. For help, contact Counseling and Psychological Services (CAPS) at (734) 764-8312 and <https://caps.umich.edu/> during and after hours, on weekends and holidays, or through its counselors physically located in schools on both North and Central Campus. You may also consult University Health Service (UHS) at (734) 764-8320 and <https://uhs.umich.edu/mentalhealthsvcs>, or for alcohol or drug concerns, see <https://uhs.umich.edu/aodprograms>.

For a listing of other mental health resources available on and off campus, visit: <https://uhs.umich.edu/stressresources>.

Sexual Misconduct/Sexual Harassment Reporting

Title IX prohibits sex discrimination to include sexual misconduct: harassment, domestic and dating violence, sexual assault, and stalking. If you or someone you know has been harassed or assaulted, you can receive confidential support and academic advocacy at the Sexual Assault Prevention and Awareness Center (SAPAC). SAPAC can be contacted on their 24-hour crisis line, 734-936-3333 and online at sapac.umich.edu. Alleged violations can be reported non-confidentially to the Office for Institutional Equity (OIE) at institutional.equity@umich.edu. Reports to law enforcement can be made to the University of Michigan Police Department at 734-763-3434.

Support for Food Insecurity

Students across the country experience food insecurity at alarming rates. The Maize and Blue Cupboard at the University of Michigan provides food, kitchen and cooking supplies, personal and household items, and support services. For information about accessing their services, please visit <https://mbc.studentlife.umich.edu/>

Confidentiality and Mandatory Reporting

As instructors, one of our responsibilities is to help create a safe learning environment. Dr. Gretchen Piatt also has a mandatory reporting responsibility related to her role as the Director of the Health Infrastructures and Learning Systems degree program. Instructors are required to share information regarding sexual misconduct or information about a crime that may have occurred on U-M's campus with the University. Students may speak to someone confidentially by contacting SAPAC's Crisis Line at (734) 936-3333.

COVID-19 Statement

For the safety of all students, faculty, and staff on campus, it is important for everyone to comply with safety measures that have been put in place for our protection. We each have a responsibility for protecting the collective health of our community. Applicable safety measures are described on the U-M Health Response website --<https://healthresponse.umich.edu/>. For current COVID-19 Guidance, please follow the following link: <https://healthresponse.umich.edu/policies-guidance/> We also encourage you to review the Statement of Student Rights and Responsibilities.

COURSE ACTIVITIES

1. **Fourteen class discussions** -These discussions provide an opportunity to explore concepts with your peers
2. **Eleven Assignments** -These assignments provide opportunities to further explore the concepts we are covering each week (lowest grade will be dropped)
3. **One midterm paper**, this paper provides an opportunity to use what was learned in the first half of the course and apply to situation presented
4. **One simulation over two weeks**, provides and opportunity to explore policy from different viewpoints

ASSIGNMENTS, DUE DATES, AND DIRECTIONS

Assessment	DUE DATE	Possible Points
Introduce Yourself	January 10	0
Response on classmates' introduction	January 12	0
Schools of Thought and Approaches to Justice Assignment (Modules 1 and 2)	January 18	25
Schools of Thought and Approaches to Justice Discussion (Modules 1 and 2)	January 21	15
First Policy Assignment (Module 3)	January 25	25
Health Information Policy Discussion (Module 3)	January 28	15
Fair Principle Assignment (Module 4)	February 1	25
Policy Question Discussion (Module 4)	February 4	15
Bioethics Timeline Infographic Assignment (Module 5)	February 8	25
Bioethics and Applied Ethics Discussion (Module 5)	February 11	15
Policy for Data and Knowledge 1 Assignment (Module 6)	February 15	25
Policy for Data and Knowledge 1 Discussion (Module 6)	February 18	15
U.S. Healthcare System Assignment (Module 7)	February 22	25
U.S. Healthcare System Discussion (Module 7)	February 25	15
Spring Break		
Midterm (Module 8)	March 7	300
Ethical Policy Issues in Health Discussion (Module 8)	March 10	15
Minister of Health Memo Assignment (Module 9)	March 14	25
Minister of Health Memo Discussion (Module 9)	March 17	15
Letter to the Editor Assignment (Module 10)	March 21	25
Letter to the Editor Discussion (Module 10)	March 24	15

Leadership Email Assignment (Module 11)	March 28	25
Leadership Email Discussion (Module 11)	March 31	15
White Paper Assignment (Module 12)	April 4	25
Social Identity Map Assignment (Module 12)	April 7	25
Simulation 1 Assignment	April 11	150
Simulation 1 Discussion	April 14	15
Simulation 2 Discussion	April 18	15
Simulation 2 Assignment	April 23	150

ASSIGNMENTS, DUE DATES, AND DIRECTIONS

- A. Thirteen discussions due weekly (except Module 12),** worth 195 possible points (15 points each)
- B. Eleven weekly assignments (due all weeks except Modules 8,13 and 14)-**These weekly assignments will be used to apply the concepts learned each week and then carried over to the discussion boards to allow for in depth analysis and discussion with peers.
- C. Midterm Assessment**
The midterm assessment will take place in Module 8 and provide an opportunity to explore the concepts taught to date to two major changes that have occurred in health information technologies.
- D. Simulation 1-**Provides an opportunity to review a scenario and identify elements of a proposed policy as it relates to an assigned group.
- E. Simulation 2 -**Provides an opportunity to continue to review the proposed policy while working to establish impacts, benefits and compromises of all groups assigned.

READINGS

Week/ Module	Date	Readings
1	Jan. 8	Mcleod, S. (2015), Mcleod, S. (2013), Psychology. (n.d.), Miller, J. G. (2001), Center for Humans and Nature. (n.d.)
2	Jan. 15	Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. (1979, April 18), Hedgecoe, A. M. (2004, March 5), Heller, N. (2018, December 31), Daniels, N. (2008, September 29), Sederstrom, N. O., & Wiggleton-Little, J. (2021, June),
3	Jan. 22	Bodenheimer, T. & Grumbach, K. (2020), Crammond, B., & Carey, G. (2017), O'Hare, M. (1989), Jacobson, P. D. (2008), Blumenthal, D., & Tavenner, M. (2010, August 5), Mello, M. M. et al(2018, March 5),

4	Jan. 29	Schmeer, K. (n.d.), Gilson, L. et al (2012, March), Morley, J. et al (2020, July 15), Vayena, E. et al. (2018), Research Data Alliance International Indigenous Data Sovereignty Interest Group. (2019, September), Wilkinson, M., et al (2016, March 15),
5	Feb. 5	Evans, J. H. (2012), De Vries, R. (2017), Jonsen, A. R.,(1993, November), Evans, J. H. (2000), Markkula Center for Applied Arts. (2015, August 1),
6	Feb. 12	Mikk, K. A., et al (2017), McGuire, A. L. et al (2019), Majumder, M. A. et al, (2017), Hongsermeier, T. et al (2011, October 22), Price, N. (2017), Strandburg, K. J. et al, (2017), Oliver, T. R. (2005, October 19),
7	Feb. 19	Bodenheimer, T., & Grumbach, K. (2020), McGinnis, J. M., & Foege, W. H. (1993), Mokdad, A. H., et al (2004, March 10), AHRQ. (n.d.), Kurani, N., & Wager, E. (2020, August 20),
		Spring Break
8	March 4	Hallsworth, M., et al (n.d.), Lazaridou, K., et al (2017), Interactive media bias chart. (n.d.), Community tool box. (n.d.), Schmeer, K. (n.d.)
9	March 11	Denburg, A., et al (2016), English, M. et al (2016), Nash, D. M., et al, (2021), Meneer, M., et al (2019), Wendler, D. (2016), Asante, K. P., et al (2016), Pinxten, W., et al (2016),
10	March 18	Faden, R. R., et al (2013), Emanuel, E. J.,et al (2017), Kass, N. E., et al (2013), Piasecki, J., & Dranseika, V. (2020)
11	March 25	O'Neil, C. (2016), Obermeyer, Z., et al (2019), Algorithmic bias playbook. (n.d.), Lander, E., & Nelson, A. (2021, October 8), Harvey, H. B., & Gowda, V. (2020), Morley, J., et al (2020),
12	April 1	Race Equity Tool: Policy Review. (n.d.), Race Equity Tool: Policy Review Worksheet. (n.d.), Alexander, M. (2008), Parsons, A., et al (2021), Brooks D, et al (2017), Park, B., et al (2019), hooks, b. (1989), Creary, M. S. (2021), Nong, P.,et al (2021)
13	April 8	Who we are – Healthy Flint research coordinating center. (n.d.), Privacy & technology. (2021, August 27), Disability rights. (2021, October 15), LGBTQ rights. (2021, May 4), Racial justice. (2021, July 22), Immigrants' rights. (2020, December 4), Issues and advocacy Michigan health and hospital association. (n.d.), U-M medical group. (2020, October 14)
14	April 15	General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. (2020, July 30)